arXiv:1611.07415v2 [math.NT] 26 Dec 2016

COMMUTATIVE ALGEBRA AND THE LINEAR DIOPHANTINE PROBLEM OF FROBENIUS

MELVYN B. NATHANSON

Abstract. Let A be a finite set of relatively prime positive integers, and let $S(A)$ be the set of all nonnegative integral linear combinations of elements of A. The set $S(A)$ is a semigroup that contains all sufficiently large integers. The largest integer not in $S(A)$ is the *Frobenius number* of A, and the number of positive integers not in $S(A)$ is the *genus* of A. Sharp and Sylvester proved in 1884 that the Frobenius number of the set $A = \{a, b\}$ is $ab - a - b$, and that the genus of A is $(a-1)(b-1)/2$. Graded rings and a simple form of Hilbert's syzygy theorem are used to give a commutative algebra proof of this result.

1. The linear diophantine problem of Frobenius

Let $\mathbf{N}_0$ be the additive semigroup of nonnegative integers. A *numerical semigroup* is a subsemigroup S of $\mathbf{N}_0$ that contains 0 and contains all sufficiently large integers.

Theorem 1. *Let $A = \{a_1, \ldots, a_k\}$ be a finite set of positive integers with card$(A) = k \geq 2$, and let* $\gcd(A)$ *denote the greatest common divisor of the integers in A. The set*

$$S(A) = \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^{k} a_i r_i : r_i \in \mathbf{N}_0 \text{ for all } i \in \{1, 2, \ldots, k\} \right\} \tag{1}$$

is a numerical semigroup if and only if $\gcd(A) = 1$.

Proof. The set $S(A)$ is a semigroup because it contains 0 and is closed under addition. Every integer in $S(A)$ is divisible by $\gcd(A)$. If $S(A)$ is a numerical semigroup, then it contains all sufficiently large integers, and so $\gcd(A) = 1$.

A basic theorem in elementary number theory states that if $\gcd(A) = 1$, then every integer n can be written as an integral linear combination of the elements of A. If

$$n = \sum_{i=1}^{k} a_i s_i$$

with $s_1, \ldots, s_k \in \mathbf{Z}$, then

$$n \equiv \sum_{i=1}^{k-1} a_i s_i \pmod{a_k}.$$

2010 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 11D07, 11B13, 05A17, 13A02, 13D02, 20M99.

Key words and phrases. Frobenius problem, linear diophantine equation, graded modules, Hilbert series, numerical semigroup.

For each $i \in \{1, \ldots, k-1\}$, there exists $r_i \in \{0, 1, 2, \ldots, a_k - 1\}$ such that $s_i \equiv r_i \pmod{a_k}$ and so

$$n \equiv \sum_{i=1}^{k-1} a_i r_i \pmod{a_k}.$$

There is an integer r_k such that

$$a_k r_k = n - \sum_{i=1}^{k-1} a_i r_i \geq n - (a_k - 1) \sum_{i=1}^{k-1} a_i.$$

If $n \geq (a_k - 1) \sum_{i=1}^{k-1} a_i$, then $r_k \geq 0$, and $n = \sum_{i=1}^{k} a_i r_i$ is a representation of n as a nonnegative integral linear combination of the elements of the A. This completes the proof. □

Let A be a finite set of positive integers with $\gcd(A) = 1$. The *Frobenius number* of A is the largest integer $\mathcal{F}(A)$ not contained in $S(A)$. The proof of Theorem 1 shows that

$$\mathcal{F}(A) \leq (a_k - 1) \sum_{i=1}^{k-1} a_i - 1.$$

The elements of the finite set $\mathbf{N}_0 \setminus S(A) = \{0, 1, 2, \ldots, \mathcal{F}(A)\} \setminus S(A)$ are called the *gaps* of $S(A)$. The *genus* of A, denoted $\mathcal{G}(A)$, is the number of gaps of $S(A)$. Because $S(A)$ is closed under addition and $\mathcal{F}(A) \notin S(A)$, it follows that if $n \in S(A)$, then $\mathcal{F}(A) - n \notin S(A)$. Therefore, $S(A)$ contains at most one element of the set $\{n, \mathcal{F}(A) - n\}$ for all $n \in \{0, 1, 2, \ldots, \mathcal{F}(A)\}$, and so $\mathcal{G}(A) \geq (\mathcal{F}(A) + 1)/2$. The numerical semigroup $S(A)$ is *symmetric* if $n \notin S(A)$ implies $\mathcal{F}(A) - n \in S(A)$.

The *linear diophantine problem of Frobenius* is to compute the integer $\mathcal{F}(A)$. In 1884, Sylvester [14] and Sharp [12] proved that the set $A = \{a, b\}$ has Frobenius number $\mathcal{F}(a, b) = ab - a - b$ and genus $\mathcal{G}(a, b) = (a - 1)(b - 1)/2$.

For sets A with $|A| \geq 3$, the problem is still unsolved and mysterious. Indeed, there is no explicit solution to the Frobenius problem even for sets A with $|A| = 3$. Methods from number theory, analysis, geometry, probability, and algebraic geometry have produced many partial results. Some of this is described in a monograph by Ramirez-Alfonsin [10], and there is much recent work (for example, Aliev-Henk [1], Arnold [2, 3], Bourgain-Sinai [4], Fel [6, 7], Fukshansky-Robins [8], Marklof [9], Schmidt [11], and Strömbergsson [13]).

In this paper we show how elementary commutative algebra has been applied to obtain the Sharp-Sylvester solution to the Frobenius problem for $k = 2$.

2. The Frobenius number $\mathcal{F}(a, b)$

In Section 4, we use commutative algebra (essentially, a simple form of the Hilbert syzygy theorem) to prove the following result.

Theorem 2. *Let $A = \{a, b\}$, where a and b are distinct, relatively prime positive integers, and let $S(A) = \{ai + bj : i, j \in \mathbf{N}_0\}$. The generating function for the gaps of the numerical semigroup $S(A)$ is the polynomial*

$$f_A(q) = \sum_{n \in \mathbf{N}_0 \setminus S(A)} q^n. \tag{2}$$

This polynomial satisfies the functional equation

$$(q^a - 1)(q^b - 1)((q-1)f_A(q) + 1) = (q-1)(q^{ab} - 1). \tag{3}$$

From Theorem 2, we need only high school algebra to deduce the Sharp-Sylvester solution of the Frobenius problem. Recall that if $a_d \neq 0$ and

$$f(q) = a_d q^d + a_{d-1} q^{d-1} + \cdots + a_1 q + a_0$$

is a polynomial of degree d, then the *reciprocal polynomial* of $f(t)$ is the polynomial

$$\hat{f}(q) = q^d f\left(\frac{1}{q}\right) = a_0 q^d + a_1 q^{d-1} + \cdots + a_{d-1} q + a_d = \sum_{i=0}^{d} a_i q^{d-i} \tag{4}$$

of degree at most d. For example, the degree 5 polynomial $f(q) = q^5 + q^2 + q$ has the degree 4 reciprocal polynomial $\hat{f}(q) = q^4 + q^3 + 1$.

Theorem 3. *Let $A = \{a, b\}$, where a and b are distinct, relatively prime positive integers, and let $S(A) = \{ai + bj : i, j \in \mathbf{N}_0\}$.*

(i) *The Frobenius number of the set A is*

$$\mathcal{F}(A) = ab - a - b.$$

(ii) *The numerical semigroup $S(A)$ is symmetric, and the genus of A is*

$$\mathcal{G}(A) = \frac{\mathcal{F}(A) + 1}{2} = \frac{(a-1)(b-1)}{2}.$$

Proof. Because $\gcd(a, b) = 1$, at least one of the integers a and b is odd, and so $(a-1)(b-1)/2$ is an integer.

The degree of the polynomial $f_A(q)$ is the Frobenius number $\mathcal{F}(A)$, which is the largest integer not in $S(A)$. Equating the degrees of the polynomials on the left and right sides of identity (3) in Theorem 2, we obtain

$$a + b + 1 + \deg(f_A(q)) = 1 + ab$$

and so

$$\mathcal{F}(A) = \deg(f_A(q)) = ab - a - b.$$

It follows that the reciprocal polynomial of $f_A(q)$ is

$$\hat{f_A}(q) = q^{ab-a-b} f\left(\frac{1}{q}\right).$$

Consider the polynomial

$$g_A(q) = \sum_{n=0}^{ab-a-b} q^n - f_A(q). \tag{5}$$

The polynomials on the left and right sides of identity (3) have degree $ab + 1$. The reciprocal polynomial of the right side of (3) is

$$q^{ab+1}\left(\left(\frac{1}{q} - 1\right)\left(\frac{1}{q^{ab}} - 1\right)\right) = (q-1)(q^{ab} - 1).$$

The reciprocal polynomial of the left side of (3) is

$$\begin{aligned} & q^{ab+1}\left(\left(\frac{1}{q^a}-1\right)\left(\frac{1}{q^b}-1\right)\left(\left(\frac{1}{q}-1\right)f\left(\frac{1}{q}\right)+1\right)\right) \\ &= (q^a-1)(q^b-1)\left(-(q-1)q^{ab-a-b}f\left(\frac{1}{q}\right)+q^{ab-a-b+1}\right) \\ &= (q^a-1)(q^b-1)\left(-(q-1)\hat{f_A}(q)+q^{ab-a-b+1}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,

$$(q^a-1)(q^b-1)\left(-(q-1)\hat{f_A}(q)+q^{ab-a-b+1}\right)=(q-1)(q^{ab}-1). \tag{6}$$

Comparing identities (3) and (6), we obtain

$$(q-1)f_A(q)+1=-(q-1)\hat{f_A}(q)+q^{ab-a-b+1}$$

and so

$$(q-1)(f_A(q)+\hat{f_A}(q))=q^{ab-a-b+1}-1=(q-1)\left(1+q+q^2+\cdots+q^{ab-a-b}\right)$$

By identity (5),

$$f_A(q)+\hat{f_A}(q)=1+q+q^2+\cdots+q^{ab-a-b}=f_A(q)+g_A(q)$$

and so $\hat{f_A}(q)=g_A(q)$. Let

$$\varepsilon_n=\begin{cases}1 & \text{if } n\in S(A)\\ 0 & \text{if } n\notin S(A).\end{cases}$$

We have

$$f_A(q)=\sum_{n=0}^{\mathcal{F}(A)}(1-\varepsilon_n)q^n$$

and

$$g_A(q)=\sum_{n=0}^{\mathcal{F}(A)}\varepsilon_n q^n$$

Recalling formula (4) for the reciprocal polynomial, we obtain

$$\hat{f_A}(q)=\sum_{n=0}^{\mathcal{F}(A)}(1-\varepsilon_n)q^{\mathcal{F}(A)-n}=\sum_{n=0}^{\mathcal{F}(A)}\left(1-\varepsilon_{\mathcal{F}(A)-n}\right)q^n=g_A(q).$$

It follows that $1-\varepsilon_{\mathcal{F}(A)-n}=\varepsilon_n$. Equivalently,

$$\varepsilon_n+\varepsilon_{\mathcal{F}(A)-n}=1$$

for all $n\in\{0,1,2,\ldots,\mathcal{F}(A)\}$. Therefore, $n\in S(A)$ if and only if $\varepsilon_n=1$ if and only if $\varepsilon_{\mathcal{F}(A)-n}=0$ if and only if $\mathcal{F}(A)-n\notin S(A)$. Thus, the semigroup $S(A)$is symmetric, and the genus of A is

$$\mathcal{G}(A)=f_A(1)=\frac{(a-1)(b-1)}{2}.$$

This completes the proof. □

3. A division algorithm in $E[x, y]$

Let E be a field, and let $E[t]$ and $E[x, y]$ be the polynomial rings in one and two variables, respectively. Let $A = \{a, b\}$, where a and b are distinct, relatively prime positive integers, and let $S(A) = \{ai + bj : i, j \in \mathbf{N}_0\}$. Consider the ring homomorphism $\Phi : E[x, y] \to E[t]$ defined by

$$\Phi(x) = t^a \qquad \text{and} \qquad \Phi(y) = t^b. \tag{7}$$

For every polynomial $f(x, y) \in E[x, y]$, we have $\Phi(f(x, y)) = f\left(t^a, t^b\right)$. Thus,

$$\Phi\left(x^b - y^a\right) = (t^a)^b - \left(t^b\right)^a = t^{ab} - t^{ab} = 0 \tag{8}$$

and so the kernel of Φ contains the polynomial $x^b - y^a$. We shall prove that the kernel of Φ is the principal ideal generated by $x^b - y^a$.

The image of Φ is the subring of $E[t]$ generated by the set $\left\{t^a, t^b\right\}$, and denoted $E[t^a, t^b]$. Because $\Phi(x^i y^j) = t^{ai+bj}$, it follows that $\{t^n : n \in S(A)\}$ is the set of monomials that appear in $E[t^a, t^b]$, and so $E[t^a, t^b]$ is a vector space over the field E with basis $\{t^n : n \in S(A)\}$.

The proof of Theorem 4 uses the division algorithm for a polynomial in k variables by a sequence of s polynomials in k variables. (This is clearly explained in Cox-Little-O'Shea [5, Chapter 2].) We need only the special case $k = 2$ and $s = 1$. Lexicographically order the monomials $x^i y^j \in E[x, y]$ as follows: $x^{i_1} y^{j_1} \prec x^{i_2} y^{j_2}$ if $i_1 < i_2$ or if $i_1 = i_2$ and $j_1 < j_2$. Every nonempty finite set of monomials has a largest element. The *leading monomial* of a nonzero polynomial $f(x, y)$ is the largest monomial that appears in the polynomial with a nonzero coefficient. For example, if a and b are positive integers, then $y^a = x^0 y^a \prec x^b y^0 = x^b$, and so x^b is the leading monomial of the polynomial $x^b - y^a$ By the division algorithm, if the leading monomial of the polynomial $f(x, y)$ is x^b for some positive integer b, then, for every polynomial $g(x, y) \in E[x, y]$, there exists a "quotient polynomial" $q(x, y) \in E[x, y]$ and "remainder polynomials" $r_i(y) \in E[y]$ for $i = 0, 1, 2, \ldots, b - 1$ such that

$$g(x, y) = q(x, y) f(x, y) + \sum_{i=0}^{b-1} x^i r_i(y). \tag{9}$$

Theorem 4. *Let a and b be distinct, relatively prime positive integers. Let E be a field, and consider the polynomial rings $E[x, y]$ and $E[t]$. Define the ring homomorphism $\Phi : E[x, y] \to E[t]$ by (7). The kernel of Φ is the principal ideal generated by $x^b - y^a$.*

Proof. Equation (8) shows that $f(x, y) = x^b - y^a \in \text{kernel}(\Phi)$.

Let $g \in \text{kernel}(\Phi)$. Using the division algorithm to divide $g(x, y)$ by $f(x, y)$, we obtain polynomials $q(x, y)$ and $r_0(y), r_1(y), \ldots, r_{b-1}(y)$ that satisfy (9). Let

$$r_i(y) = \sum_{j=0}^{d_i} c_{i,j} y^j$$

for $i = 0, 1, 2, \ldots, b - 1$. Equation (9) gives

$$g(x, y) = q(x, y) f(x, y) + \sum_{i=0}^{b-1} \sum_{j=0}^{d_i} c_{i,j} x^i y^j.$$

Because $\Phi(g(x,y)) = \Phi(f(x,y)) = 0$, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} 0 = \Phi(g(x,y)) &= \Phi\left(q(x,y)f(x,y) + \sum_{i=0}^{b-1} \sum_{j=0}^{d_i} c_{i,j} x^i y^j \right) \\ &= \Phi(q(x,y))\Phi(f(x,y)) + \sum_{i=0}^{b-1} \sum_{j=0}^{d_i} c_{i,j} \Phi\left(x^i y^j\right) \\ &= \sum_{i=0}^{b-1} \sum_{j=0}^{d_i} c_{i,j} t^{ai+bj}. \end{aligned}$$

For

$$(i_1, j_1) \in \{0, 1, \ldots, b-1\} \times \mathbf{N}_0$$

and

$$(i_2, j_2) \in \{0, 1, \ldots, b-1\} \times \mathbf{N}_0$$

we have

$$t^{ai_1+bj_1} = t^{ai_2+bj_2}$$

if and only if

$$ai_1 + bj_1 = ai_2 + bj_2$$

if and only if

$$a(i_2 - i_1) = b(j_2 - j_1).$$

Because b divides $a(i_2 - i_1)$ and $\gcd(a,b) = 1$, it follows that b divides $i_2 - i_1$. The inequality $0 \leq |i_2 - i_1| \leq b - 1$ implies that $i_1 = i_2$ and so $j_1 = j_2$. Thus, the integers in the set

$$\{ai + bj : i \in \{0, 1, \ldots, b-1\} \text{ and } j \in N_0\}$$

are pairwise distinct elements of the semigroup $S(A)$, and the corresponding monomials t^{ai+bj} are pairwise distinct. The polynomial identity

$$\sum_{i=0}^{b-1} \sum_{j=0}^{d_i} c_{i,j} t^{ai+bj} = 0$$

implies that $c_{i,j} = 0$ for all i and j, and so $r_i(y) = 0$ for $i = 0, 1, \ldots, b-1$, and

$$g(x,y) = q(x,y)f(x,y).$$

Thus, the kernel of Φ is the principal ideal generated by $f(x,y)$. This completes the proof. □

4. Graded rings and modules

Let R be a commutative ring with 1. The ring R is *graded* if it contains a sequence $(R_n)_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of additive subgroups such that, first, as an additive abelian group,

$$R = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$$

and, second, as a ring, multiplication in R satisfies

$$R_m R_n \subseteq R_{m+n} \tag{10}$$

for all $m, n \in \mathbf{N}_0$. In particular, $R_0 R_0 \subseteq R_0$ and $1 \in R_0$, and so R_0 is a ring. Similarly, for every $n \in \mathbf{N}_0$, we have $R_0 R_n \subseteq R_n$, and so R_n is an R_0-module.

Let $R = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$ be a graded ring. An R-module M is *graded* if M contains a sequence $(M_n)_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of additive subgroups such that, first, as an additive abelian group,

$$M = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} M_n$$

and, second, as an R-module, multiplication satisfies

$$R_m M_n \subseteq M_{m+n}$$

for all $m, n \in \mathbf{N}_0$. Because $R_0 M_n \subseteq M_n$, it follows that M_n is an R_0-module for all $n \in \mathbf{N}_0$. If $f_n \in M_n$ for all n, and if $f = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} f_n = 0$, then $f_n = 0$ for all n.

If $R_0 = E$ is a field, then M_n is a vector space over E. If M_n is a finite-dimensional vector space for all n, then the formal power series

$$H_M(q) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \dim(M_n) q^n$$

is called the *Hilbert series* for M.

Relation (10) implies that every graded ring R is also a graded R-module with $M_n = R_n$ for all $n \in \mathbf{N}_0$.

Let $R = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$ be a graded ring, and let $M = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} M_n$ and $M' = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} M'_n$ be graded R-modules. An R-module homomorphism $\Phi : M \to M'$ is *graded* if $\Phi(M_n) \subseteq M'_n$ for all $n \in \mathbf{N}_0$. Define the R_0-module homomorphism $\varphi_n : M_n \to M'_n$ by restriction: $\varphi_n(f_n) = \Phi(f_n)$ for all $f_n \in M_n$. The kernel of φ_n is a submodule, denoted K_n, of M_n, and so $K = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} K_n$ is a graded R-module. If $f = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} f_n \in K$ with $f_n \in K_n$ for all n, then

$$\Phi(f) = \Phi\left(\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} f_n\right) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \Phi\left(f_n\right) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \varphi_n\left(f_n\right) = 0$$

and so $f \in \text{kernel}(\Phi)$. Therefore, $K \subseteq \text{kernel}(\Phi)$.

Conversely, if $f \in \text{kernel}(\Phi)$ and if $f = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} f_n$ with $f_n \in M_n$ for all n, then

$$0 = \Phi(f) = \Phi\left(\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} f_n\right) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \varphi_n\left(f_n\right)$$

with $\varphi_n\left(f_n\right) \in M_n$, and so $\varphi_n\left(f_n\right) = 0$. Therefore, $f_n \in \text{kernel}(\varphi_n) = K_n$ and $f \in K$. This proves that $K = \text{kernel}(\Phi)$.

Here are some examples of graded rings and modules. Let E be a field. The polynomial ring $E[t]$ is a vector space over E. For every $n \in \mathbf{N}_0$, let $R_n = Et^n$ be the one-dimensional subspace of $E[t]$ spanned by t^n. The identity $t^m t^n = t^{m+n}$ implies that $R_m R_n \subseteq R_{m+n}$, and so $E[t] = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$ is a graded ring with $\dim(R_n) = 1$ for all n. As a graded $E[t]$-module, the Hilbert series for $E[t]$ is

$$H_{E[t]}(q) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} q^n = \frac{1}{1-q}.$$

Let a and b be distinct, relatively prime positive integers, and let $S(A) = \{ai+bj : i, j \in \mathbf{N}_0\}$. Consider the ring $E[t^a, t^b]$. As a vector space over E, a basis for $E[t^a, t^b]$ is the set of monomials

$$\{t^{ai+bj} : (i, j) \in \mathbf{N}_0^2\} = \{t^n : n \in S(A)\}$$

and so

$$E[t^a, t^b] = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$$

where

$$R_n = \begin{cases} Et^n & \text{if } n \in S(A) \\ 0 & \text{if } n \notin S(A). \end{cases} \tag{11}$$

Thus, $\dim(R_n) = 1$ if $n \in S(A)$ and $\dim(R_n) = 0$ if $n \notin S(A)$. Note that $R_0 = E$ because $0 \in S(A)$. As a graded $E[t^a, t^b]$-module, the Hilbert series for $E[t^a, t^b]$ is

$$H_{E[t^a,t^b]}(q) = \sum_{n \in S(A)} q^n = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} q^n - \sum_{n \in \mathbf{N}_0 \setminus S(A)} q^n = \frac{1}{1-q} - f_A(q)$$

where $f_A(q)$ is the polynomial defined by (2).

A ring can be graded in many ways. For example, in the polynomial ring $E[x, y]$, the degree of the monomial $x^i y^j$ is $i + j$. If R_n is the vector subspace of $E[x, y]$ generated by the set of monomials of degree n, that is, by the set $\{x^n, x^{n-1}y, x^{n-2}y^2, \ldots, y^n\}$, then R_n is an E-vector space of dimension $n + 1$, and $E[x, y] = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$ is a graded ring. With this grading by degree, as an $E[x, y]$-module, the Hilbert series for the polynomial ring $E[x, y]$ is

$$\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (n+1)q^n = \frac{1}{(1-q)^2}.$$

For the Frobenius problem, we use a different grading of $E[x, y]$. Let E_n be the vector subspace of $E[x, y]$ generated by the set of monomials

$$\{x^i y^j : ai + bj = n\}.$$

The number of monomials in this set is exactly $p_{a,b}(n)$, which is the number of partitions of n into parts a and b. Euler observed that the generating function for this partition function is the formal power series

$$\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} p_{a,b}(n)q^n = \left(\sum_{i=0}^{\infty} q^{ai}\right)\left(\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} q^{bj}\right) = \frac{1}{(1-q^a)(1-q^b)}.$$

If $x^i y^j \in E_m$ and $x^k y^\ell \in E_n$, then

$$\begin{aligned} ai + bj &= m \\ ak + b\ell &= n \\ a(i+k) + b(j+\ell) &= m + n \end{aligned}$$

and so

$$\left(x^i y^j\right)\left(x^k y^\ell\right) = x^{i+k} y^{j+\ell} \in E_{m+n}.$$

This implies that $E_m E_n \subseteq E_{m+n}$ and so $E[x, y] = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} E_n$ is a graded ring. Because $ai + bj = 0$ if and only if $i = j = 0$, we have $E_0 = E$, and so E_n is a vector space over the field E with $\dim(E_n) = p_{a,b}(n)$. With this "Frobenius grading,", the Hilbert series for $E[x, y]$ is

$$H_{E[x,y]}(q) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \dim(E_n)q^n = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} p_{a,b}(n)q^n = \frac{1}{(1-q^a)(1-q^b)}. \tag{12}$$

Let $E[t^a, t^b] = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$, with R_n defined by (11). We define a "multiplication"

$$E[x, y] \times E[t^a, t^b] \to E[t^a, t^b]$$

as follows: $xt^n = t^{a+n}$ and $yt^n = t^{b+n}$ for all $n \in S(A)$. Thus, if $x^i y^j \in E_m$ and $n \in S(A)$, then $ai + bj = m$ and $x^i y^j t^n = t^{ai+bj+n} = t^{m+n}$. Therefore, $E_m R_n \subseteq R_{m+n}$ for all $m, n \in \mathbf{N}_0$, and $E[t^a, t^b]$ is a graded $E[x, y]$-module.

The function $\Phi : E[x, y] \to E[t^a, t^b]$ defined by $\Phi(x) = t^a$ and $\Phi(y) = t^b$ is a surjective ring homomorphism. Theorem 4 states that $K = \text{kernel}(\Phi)$ is the principal ideal of $E[x, y]$ generated by the polynomial $f = f(x, y) = x^b - y^a \in E_{ab}$. Thus, the kernel of Φ is the graded ring

$$K = E[x, y]f = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} E_n f = \bigoplus_{n=ab}^{\infty} E_{n-ab} f = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} K_n$$

where $E_{n-ab} f \subseteq E_n$ and

$$K_n = K \cap E_n = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } n = 0, 1, \ldots, ab-1 \\ E_{n-ab} f(x, y) & \text{if } n \geq ab. \end{cases}$$

For all $x^i y^j \in E_m$, we have $ai + bj = m$ and

$$\Phi(x^i y^j) = t^{ai+bj} = x^i y^j \Phi(1) \in E[t^a, t^b]$$

and so $\Phi : E[x, y] \to E[t^a, t^b]$ is also an $E[x, y]$-module homomorphism. The Hilbert series for K is

$$\begin{aligned} H_K(q) &= \sum_{n=ab}^{\infty} \dim(K_n) q^n = \sum_{n=ab}^{\infty} \dim(E_{n-ab} f) q^n \\ &= \sum_{n=ab}^{\infty} \dim(E_{n-ab}) q^n = q^{ab} \sum_{n=ab}^{\infty} \dim(E_{n-ab}) q^{n-ab} \\ &= q^{ab} \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \dim(E_n) q^n = \frac{q^{ab}}{(1-q^a)(1-q^b)}. \end{aligned}$$

The final equation comes from (12).

We have the graded $E[x, y]$-modules $E[x, y] = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} E_n$ and $E[t^a, t^b] = \bigoplus_{n=0}^{\infty} R_n$, and the $E[x, y]$-module homomorphism $\Phi : E[x, y] \to E[t^a, t^b]$. The restriction of Φ to E_n is the linear transformation $\varphi : E_n \to R_n$, where $R_n \neq 0$ if and only if $n \in S(A)$. If $n \in S(A)$, then there exist nonnegative integers i and j such that $n = ai + bj$. Because $x^i y^j \in E_n$ and $\varphi_n(x^i y^j) = t^{ai+bj} = t^n$, it follows that φ_n is surjective for all $n \in \mathbf{N}_0$. The kernel of φ_n is K_n. By the rank-nullity theorem in linear algebra,

$$\dim(E_n) = \dim(R_n) + \dim(K_n). \tag{13}$$

Multiplying this equation by q^n and summing over n, we obtain the following Hilbert series identity:

$$\begin{aligned} H_{E[x,y]}(q) &= \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \dim(E_n) q^n = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (\dim(R_n) + \dim(K_n)) q^n \\ &= \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \dim(R_n) q^n + \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \dim(K_n) q^n \\ &= H_{E[t^a,t^b]}(q) + H_K(q). \end{aligned}$$

Equivalently,

$$\frac{1}{(1-q^a)(1-q^b)} = \frac{1}{1-q} - f_A(q) + \frac{q^{ab}}{(1-q^a)(1-q^b)} = 0$$

and so

$$(q^a - 1)(q^b - 1)((q-1)f_A(q) + 1) = (q-1)(q^{ab} - 1).$$

This completes the proof of Theorem 2.

References

[1] I. Aliev and M. Henk, *Integer knapsacks: average behavior of the Frobenius numbers*, Math. Oper. Res. **34** (2009), 698–705.

[2] V. I. Arnold, *Geometry and growth rate of Frobenius numbers of additive semigroups*, Math. Phys. Anal. Geom. **9** (2006), 95–108.

[3] ———, *Arithmetical turbulence of selfsimilar fluctuations statistics of large Frobenius numbers of additive semigroups of integers*, Mosc. Math. J. **7** (2007), 173–193, 349.

[4] J. Bourgain and Ya. G. Sinaĭ, *Limit behavior of large Frobenius numbers*, Uspekhi Mat. Nauk **62** (2007), 77–90.

[5] D. Cox, J. Little, and D. O'Shea, *Ideals, Varieties, and Algorithms*, second ed., Undergraduate Texts in Mathematics, Springer-Verlag, New York, 1997.

[6] L. G. Fel, *Analytic representations in the three-dimensional Frobenius problem*, Funct. Anal. Other Math. **2** (2008), 27–44.

[7] ———, *Weak asymptotics in the 3-dim Frobenius problem*, Funct. Anal. Other Math. **2** (2009), 179–202.

[8] L. Fukshansky and S. Robins, *Frobenius problem and the covering radius of a lattice*, Discrete Comput. Geom. **37** (2007), 471–483.

[9] J. Marklof, *The asymptotic distribution of Frobenius numbers*, Invent. Math. **181** (2010), 179–207.

[10] J. L. Ramírez Alfonsín, *The Diophantine Frobenius Problem*, Oxford Lecture Series in Mathematics and its Applications, vol. 30, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2005.

[11] W. M. Schmidt, *Integer matrices, sublattices of $\mathbb{Z}^m$, and Frobenius numbers*, Monatsh. Math. **178** (2015), 405–451.

[12] W. J. Curran Sharp, *Solution to Problem 7382*, Mathematic Questions with their Solutions from the "Educational Times", vol. 41, Francis Hodgson, London, 1884.

[13] Andreas Strömbergsson, *On the limit distribution of Frobenius numbers*, Acta Arith. **152** (2012), 81–107.

[14] J. J. Sylvester, *Problem 7382*, Educational Times **37** (1884), 26.

Department of Mathematics, Lehman College (CUNY), Bronx, NY 10468
E-mail address: melvyn.nathanson@lehman.cuny.edu